

Torture and Interrogation

Fall 2005 White Paper Term Project for:
UW CSEP 590 tu (Homeland Security / Cybersecurity)
UCB PP 190/290-009

Team Members:

Barbra Ramos (UCB GSPP)
Christopher DuPuis (UW PMP)
Dennis Galvin (UW PMP)
Eiman Zolfaghari (UW PMP)
Sean David Cardeno (UCB GSPP)

Overall question / area of investigation: Under what circumstances, if any, should the use of torture to obtain information from prisoners be considered acceptable?

List of Potential Sub-Topics:

Definitions:

- Interrogation
- Torture

Short History of Torture

- Medieval times to Present Time

Organizational use of torture

- Police, Military, Anti-state forces (revolutionary, terrorist), Intelligence agencies.
- Nations involved in torture (US, Russia, Israel?, China?)
- Examples:
 1. US Military/CIA use of torture (Extraordinary Rendition, Abu Ghraib, Guantanamo)

Organizations monitoring torture

- Human Rights Watch
- Amnesty International
- United Nations

Torture Legislation or Law

- US
- non-US?
- International?
 1. Geneva Convention(s). #3 deals with prisoners of war. #4 deals with civilians.
 2. UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (1964, enacted 1967)

Motivation for and efficacy of using torture in interrogation

- Quickly get strategic information?
- Quality of information extracted?

Benefits / Repercussions of using torture

- Diplomatic and Political
- Decreased civil liberty?
- Increased safety of society?
- Public Reactions (internal, external)
- Media image

Is there an ethical case for torture? The ticking bomb (Dershowitz and others).

Torture in times of war, times of peace

How the work will be divided

The team assembled on Wednesday, 09-Nov, and we are still in the process of determining the overall shape of the topic to be covered in the paper. We have sketched a preliminary (subject to change) outline of areas to investigate. Each team member will then identify an area they will maintain primary responsibility for. As progress is made in each area, the information should be posted to the wiki, and other team members should offer constructive criticism, advice, etc.

We have a starting point reading / resource / reference list which will be added to over the course of the initial phases of the project.

So far, the following team members have expressed preliminary interest in portions of the overall paper:

- Christopher DuPuis: "History of Torture", "Efficacy of Torture in Interrogation"
- Dennis Galvin: "Torture Legislation / Law"
- Barbra Ramos: "Nations involved in torture", or "Organizations Monitoring Torture"
- Sean Cardeno: "Organizational Use of Torture"
- Eiman Zolfaghari: "Benefits / Repercussions of Torture"

Potential Reading / Resource List:

The first three are from the assignment pdf. The rest were from directed Googling. Feel free to add as many more as you like. Add comments too.

- Dershowitz, **Why Terrorism Works...** Chapter 4 might be a good starting place. Also Dershowitz wrote an op ed piece for the LA times approximate date November 2001.
- Solzhenitsyn, **Gulag Archipelago...** This is massive
- Mackey, **Interrogator's War.**
- Human Rights Watch: <http://www.hrw.org>
 - **Torture: A Human Rights Perspective** (new book by Human Rights Watch)
- Michael Levin **The Case For Torture:**
<http://people.brandeis.edu/~teuber/torture.html>
- Amnesty International: <http://www.amnesty.org>
 - **Amnesty International Statement on Torture:**
<http://web.amnesty.org/pages/stoptorture-260605-statement-eng> (This was the first of 25 hits from entering 'torture' in Amnesty's site search).
- Patrick Buchanan, **The Case for Torture:**
<http://www.theamericancause.org/patthecasefortorture.htm>
- Geneva Convention(s):
 - Society of Professional Journalists: **Reference Guide to the Geneva Conventions:** <http://www.genevaconventions.org/>
 - Geneva Convention Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War:
<http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/91.htm>
 - Wikipedia article on Geneva Conventions:
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Geneva_Conventions
- United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights: <http://www.ohchr.org/english/>
 - also the following page has an extensive section of references on "HUMAN RIGHTS IN THE ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE: PROTECTION OF PERSONS SUBJECT TO DETENTION OR IMPRISONMENT":
<http://www.ohchr.org/english/law/index.htm>

- Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment: http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu3/b/h_cat39.htm
- PBS Frontline piece (**The Torture Question**): <http://www.pbs.org/frontline/torture/>
- Washington Post expose on secretly run prisons in eastern Europe 2-Nov-2005
- Vanity Fair Article (November 2005): "**Torture: Is it ever OK? Does it Make us safer?**"
 - spotted on Human Rights Watch site (see above)
- CIA, **Human Resource Exploitation Training Manual** - 1983
 - Part 1: <http://www.gwu.edu/~nsarchiv/NSAEBB/NSAEBB122/CIA%20Human%20Res%20Exploit%20A1-G11.pdf>
 - Part 2: <http://www.gwu.edu/~nsarchiv/NSAEBB/NSAEBB122/CIA%20Human%20Res%20Exploit%20H0-L17.pdf>
- CIA, KUBARK Counterintelligence Interrogation, July 1963
 - Part 1: <http://www.gwu.edu/~nsarchiv/NSAEBB/NSAEBB122/CIA%20Kubark%201-60.pdf>
 - Part 2: <http://www.gwu.edu/~nsarchiv/NSAEBB/NSAEBB122/CIA%20Kubark%2061-112.pdf>
 - Part 3: <http://www.gwu.edu/~nsarchiv/NSAEBB/NSAEBB122/CIA%20Kubark%20113-128.pdf>
- Red Cross: <http://www.icrc.org>