

Limitations, Gaps and Critiques of Value Sensitive Design

INSC 543/CSE 599P
Value Sensitive Design

Note: Optional class November 25 – Thanksgiving Eve

**Email Discussion Question: 5 PM Tuesday, December 1
For Class: Wednesday, December 2**

Thus far we've been studying what Value Sensitive Design offers, in terms of theory and method for the design of information and computer systems. That said Value Sensitive Design is a work-in-progress. For class December 2, we'll look at what's missing or perhaps plain wrong: What are the limitations of Value Sensitive Design? Where are there gaps where new work is needed to fill out the existing theory, methods, and proof-of-concept systems? What are the critiques, both published and that have occurred to you as the class has unfolded – issues that Value Sensitive Design as currently conceptualized has just gotten wrong?

To begin our exploration of these topics, we'll read two critiques. The first paper by Le Dantec and Edwards argues that Value Sensitive Design makes a mistake in the order in which the tripartite investigations are applied; the second paper offers an alternative to Value Sensitive Design.

Le Dantec, C. A., Poole, E. S., Wyche, S. P. (2009). Values as lived experience: Evolving Value Sensitive Design in support of value discovery. *Proceedings of CHI 2009*. New York, NY: ACM Press, 1141-1150.

Cockton, G. (2009). Getting there. Six meta-principles and interaction design. *Proceedings of CHI 2009*. New York, NY: ACM Press, 2223-2232.

As you read, please reflect on how the substance of these critiques. What are they? Are they well articulated and substantiated? In what ways do you agree or disagree with them?

WRITE a question that you would be interested in discussing that in some ways addresses these critiques. Again, if you would like to situate your question about method in the context of your own work, please feel free to do so. Then provide an initial discussion of your own question. As before, your writing should be concise, grammatically correct, and, as appropriate, draw on (and at times quote from) the reading.

In addition, give some thought to what you see as the limitations, gaps, or misguided aspects of Value Sensitive Design. WRITE a list of bullet points that (a) identify a limitation, gap or misguided aspect (say which you think it is); (b) give it a shorthand name so it will be easy for us to refer to; and (c) provide a concise 1 – 3 sentence characterization of the issue.

Please EMAIL your question and discussion as well as your list of limitations, gaps and misguided notions to Batya at batya@u.washington.edu in the BODY OF AN EMAIL MESSAGE no later than 5 PM Tuesday afternoon, December 1. (Alas Alan will be out of town that week, but please cc him also.) We will use your questions and materials to structure some of the discussion on Wednesday.

No late questions will be accepted.