## Supplementary Material for Recurrent Networks

Compiled by:
Rajesh P. N. Rao
Computational Neuroscience



## Solving the Differential Equation for a Linear Recurrent Network

$$
\tau \frac{d \mathbf{v}}{d t}=-\mathbf{v}+\underbrace{\mathrm{Wu}}_{\mathbf{h}}+\mathrm{Mv}
$$

## Using Eigenvectors to Solve for $\mathbf{v}(t)$

$$
\tau \frac{d \mathbf{v}}{d t}=-\mathbf{v}+\mathbf{h}+\mathbf{M} \mathbf{v}
$$

- Suppose $N \times N$ matrix M is symmetric
$\downarrow \mathrm{M}$ has $N$ orthogonal eigenvectors $\mathbf{e}_{i}$ and $N$ eigenvalues $\lambda_{i}$ which satisfy:
$\mathrm{Me}_{i}=\lambda_{i} \mathbf{e}_{i}$
* Normalize eigenvectors to have length 1
$\Rightarrow$ Divide each by its length
* Then we have a set of orthonormal vectors (a new "basis" or coordinate system) such that:

$$
\mathbf{e}_{i} \cdot \mathbf{e}_{j}=0 \text { for } i \neq j \text { and } 1 \text { otherwise }
$$

## Using Eigenvectors to Solve for $\mathbf{v}(t)$

$\downarrow$ We can represent any N -dimensional vector, including our output vector $\mathbf{v}(t)$, using the orthonormal eigenvectors of M :

$$
\mathbf{v}(t)=\sum_{j=1}^{N} c_{j}(t) \mathbf{e}_{j}
$$

- Substituting above in the diff. equation for $\mathbf{v}: \tau \frac{d \mathbf{v}}{d t}=-\mathbf{v}+\mathbf{h}+\mathrm{Mv}$

$$
\tau \frac{d \sum_{j=1}^{N} c_{j_{j}} \mathbf{e}_{j}}{d t}=-\sum_{j=1}^{N} c_{\mathbf{j}_{j}}+\mathbf{h}+\mathrm{M} \sum_{j=1}^{N} c_{j} \mathbf{e}_{j}
$$

$$
\tau \sum_{j=1}^{N} \frac{d c_{j}}{d t} \mathbf{e}_{j}=-\sum_{j=1}^{N} c_{j}\left(\mathbf{e}_{j}-\mathbf{M} \mathbf{e}_{j}\right)+\mathbf{h}
$$

Using eigenvector equation

$$
\tau \sum_{j=1}^{N} \frac{d c_{j}}{d t} \mathbf{e}_{j}=-\sum_{j=1}^{N} c_{j}\left(\mathbf{e}_{j}-\lambda_{j} \mathbf{e}_{j}\right)+\mathbf{h}
$$

$$
\mathrm{Me}_{j}=\lambda_{j} \mathbf{e}_{j}
$$

## Using Eigenvectors to Solve for $\mathbf{v}(t)$

$\uparrow$ Taking the dot product of both sides with any $\mathbf{e}_{i}$ :

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \left(\tau \sum_{j=1}^{N} \frac{d c_{j}}{d t} \mathbf{e}_{j}=-\sum_{j=1}^{N} c_{j}\left(\mathbf{e}_{j}-\lambda_{j} \mathbf{e}_{j}\right)+\mathbf{h}\right) \cdot \mathbf{e}_{i} \\
& \tau \frac{d c_{i}}{d t}=-c_{i}\left(1-\lambda_{i}\right)+\mathbf{h} \cdot \mathbf{e}_{i}
\end{aligned}
$$

Using orthonormality of the $\mathbf{e}_{i}$
$\uparrow$ Solve differential equation for $c_{i}$ (and use it to get $\mathbf{v}(t)!$ ):

$$
\begin{aligned}
& c_{i}(t)=\frac{\mathbf{h} \cdot \mathbf{e}_{i}}{1-\lambda_{i}}\left(1-\exp \left(\frac{-t\left(1-\lambda_{i}\right)}{\tau}\right)+c_{i}(0) \exp \left(\frac{-t\left(1-\lambda_{i}\right)}{\tau}\right)\right) \\
& \mathbf{v}(t)=\sum_{i=1}^{N} c_{i}(t) \mathbf{e}_{i}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Eigenvalues determine Network Stability!

$\mathbf{v}(t)=\sum_{i=1}^{N} c_{i}(t) \mathbf{e}_{i} \quad c_{i}(t)=\frac{\mathbf{h} \cdot \mathbf{e}_{i}}{1-\lambda_{i}}\left(1-\exp \left(\frac{-t\left(1-\lambda_{i}\right)}{\tau}\right)+c_{i}(0) \exp \left(\frac{-t\left(1-\lambda_{i}\right)}{\tau}\right)\right)$

If any $\lambda_{i}>1, \mathbf{v}(t)$ explodes $\Rightarrow$ network is unstable!

If all $\lambda_{i}<1$, network is stable and $\mathbf{v}(t)$ converges to steady state value :
$\mathbf{v}_{s s}=\sum_{i} \frac{\mathbf{h} \cdot \mathbf{e}_{i}}{1-\lambda_{i}} \mathbf{e}_{i}$

## Amplification of Inputs in a Recurrent Network

$$
\mathbf{v}_{s s}=\sum_{i} \frac{\mathbf{h} \cdot \mathbf{e}_{i}}{1-\lambda_{i}} \mathbf{e}_{i}
$$

If all $\lambda_{i}<1$ and one $\lambda_{i}\left(\right.$ say $\left.\lambda_{1}\right)$ is close to 1 with others much smaller :

$$
\mathbf{v}_{s s} \approx \frac{\mathbf{h} \cdot \mathbf{e}_{1}}{1-\lambda_{1}} \mathbf{e}_{1} \quad \begin{aligned}
& \text { Amplification of input } \\
& \text { projection by a factor of } \frac{1}{1-\lambda_{i}}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Memory in Linear Recurrent Networks

$\tau \frac{d \mathbf{v}}{d t}=-\mathbf{v}+\mathbf{h}+\mathbf{M} \mathbf{v} \quad \mathbf{v}(t)=\sum_{i=1}^{N} c_{i}(t) \mathbf{e}_{i}$
Suppose $\lambda_{1}=1$ and all other $\lambda_{i}<1$. Then, $\tau \frac{d c_{1}}{d t}=\mathbf{h} \cdot \mathbf{e}_{1}$
Solving for $c_{1}$, we get $c_{1}(t)=c_{1}(0)+\frac{1}{\tau} \int_{0}^{t} \mathbf{h}\left(t^{\prime}\right) \mathbf{e}_{1} d t^{\prime} \tau$
If input $\mathbf{h}$ is turned on and then off, can show that even after $\mathbf{h}=0$ :

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathbf{v}(t) & =\sum_{i} c_{i}(t) \mathbf{e}_{i} \\
& \approx c_{1} \mathbf{e}_{1}=\frac{\mathbf{e}_{1}}{\tau} \int_{0}^{t} \mathbf{h}\left(t^{\prime}\right) \mathbf{e}_{1} d t^{\prime} \quad\left(\text { assuming } c_{1}(0)=0\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Sustained activity without any input!
Networks keeps a memory of integral of past input


## Stability of Nonlinear Recurrent Networks

$$
\tau \frac{d \mathbf{v}}{d t}=-\mathbf{v}+F(\mathbf{h}+\mathbf{M} \mathbf{v})
$$

## Stability Analysis of Nonlinear Recurrent Networks

General case : $\frac{d \mathbf{v}}{d t}=\mathbf{f}(\mathbf{v})$
Suppose $\mathbf{v}_{\infty}$ is a fixed point (i.e., $\mathbf{f}\left(\mathbf{v}_{\infty}\right)=0$ ) network near $\mathbf{v}_{\infty}$ ?
Near $\mathbf{v}_{\infty}, \mathbf{v}(t)=\mathbf{v}_{\infty}+\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t)$. Differentiating both sides wrt $t: \frac{d \mathbf{v}}{d t}=\frac{d \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}}{d t}$.
Taylor expansion near $\mathbf{v}_{\infty}: \mathbf{f}(\mathbf{v}(t)) \approx \mathbf{f}\left(\mathbf{v}_{\infty}\right)+\left.\frac{\partial \mathbf{f}}{\partial \mathbf{v}}\right|_{\mathbf{v}_{\infty}} \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t)=\left.\frac{\partial \mathbf{f}}{\partial \mathbf{v}}\right|_{\mathbf{v}_{\infty}} \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t)$
i.e. $\frac{d \mathbf{v}}{d t}=\mathbf{f}(\mathbf{v}(t))=\left.\frac{\partial \mathbf{f}}{\partial \mathbf{v}}\right|_{\mathbf{v}_{\infty}} \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t)=J \cdot \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t) \quad J$ is the stability or "Jacobian" matrix

Also, since $\frac{d \mathbf{v}}{d t}=\frac{d \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}}{d t}$, we have $\frac{d \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}}{d t}=J \cdot \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t)$
Assuming $J$ is real with $N$ linearly independent eigenvectors $\mathbf{e}_{i}$, we can write :
$\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t)=\sum_{i} c_{i}(t) \mathbf{e}_{i}$

## Stability Analysis of Nonlinear Recurrent Networks

Continued from previous page :
Substituting $\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t)=\sum_{i} c_{i}(t) \mathbf{e}_{i}$ into $\frac{d \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}}{d t}=J \cdot \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t)$, we find that the coefficients must satisfy :
$\frac{d c_{i}}{d t}=\lambda_{i} c_{i}$. The solution is : $c_{i}(t)=c_{i}(0) \exp \left(\lambda_{i} t\right)$
Therefore, $\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}(t)=\sum_{i} c_{i}(0) \exp \left(\lambda_{i} t\right) \mathbf{e}_{i}$ i.e., evolution of $\mathbf{v}(t)$ near $\mathbf{v}_{\infty}$ depends on eigenvalues of $J$.
Each individual term in the above sum is called a mode.
Eigenvalues of $J$ can be complex, e.g., $\lambda_{k}=a_{k}+i b_{k}$, which means that :
$\exp \left(\lambda_{k} t\right)=\exp \left(a_{k} t\right) \exp \left(i b_{k} t\right)=\exp \left(a_{k} t\right)\left(\cos \left(b_{k} t\right)+i \sin \left(b_{k} t\right)\right)$. This implies :
For complex $\lambda_{k}\left(b_{k} \neq 0\right)$, the mode will oscillate with frequency $b_{k}$.
If $a_{k}<0$ for all $k$, the oscillations will be damped exponentially to 0 and the network will be stable near the fixed point $\mathbf{v}_{\infty}$.
If $a_{k}>0$ for any $k$, the oscillations for that mode will grow exponentially and the network may not be stable (unless the network's nonlinearity curbs the growth as in the following example).

## Example: Non-Symmetric Nonlinear Recurrent Network

$\uparrow$ Example: Network of Excitatory (E) and Inhibitory (I) Neurons $\Rightarrow$ Connections can't be symmetric: Why?

$$
\begin{aligned}
& 10 \mathrm{~ms} \longrightarrow \tau_{E} \frac{d v_{E}}{d t}=-v_{E}+\left[\begin{array}{cc}
1.25 & -1
\end{array} M_{E E} v_{E}+M_{E I} v_{I}-\gamma_{E}\right]^{+} \\
& { }_{\nearrow}^{\tau_{I}} \frac{d v_{I}}{d t}=-v_{I}+\left[\stackrel{0}{M}_{I I} v_{I}+M_{I E} v_{E}-\gamma_{I}\right]^{+}
\end{aligned}
$$

Parameter
we will vary to study the network

We want to analyze stability of this network near fixed point $\mathbf{v}_{\infty}$ i.e., near the $\left(v_{E}, v_{I}\right)$
which results in $\frac{d v_{E}}{d t}=\frac{d v_{I}}{d t}=0$.

## Linear Stability Analysis near Fixed Point

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
\frac{d v_{E}}{d t}=\frac{-v_{E}+\left[M_{E E} v_{E}+M_{E I} v_{I}-\gamma_{E}\right]^{+}}{\tau_{E}} & \begin{array}{l}
\text { Take derivatives of right } \\
\text { hand side with respect to } \\
\frac{d v_{I}}{d t}
\end{array}=\frac{-v_{I}+\left[M_{I I} v_{I}+M_{I E} v_{E}-\gamma_{I}\right]^{+}}{\tau_{I}}
\end{array}
$$

Stability Matrix (aka the "Jacobian" Matrix):

$$
J=\left[\begin{array}{cc}
\frac{\left(M_{E E}-1\right)}{\tau_{E}} & \frac{M_{E I}}{\tau_{E}} \\
\frac{M_{I E}}{\tau_{I}} & \frac{\left(M_{I I}-1\right)}{\tau_{I}}
\end{array}\right]
$$

## Compute the Eigenvalues

- Jacobian Matrix:

$$
J=\left[\begin{array}{cc}
\frac{\left(M_{E E}-1\right)}{\tau_{E}} & \frac{M_{E I}}{\tau_{E}} \\
\frac{M_{I E}}{\tau_{I}} & \frac{\left(M_{I I}-1\right)}{\tau_{I}}
\end{array}\right]
$$

$\uparrow$ Its two eigenvalues (obtained by solving $\operatorname{det}(J-\lambda \mathrm{I})=0$ ):
$\lambda=\frac{1}{2}\left(\frac{\left(M_{E E}-1\right)}{\tau_{E} 10 \mathrm{~ms}}+\frac{\left(M_{I I}-1\right)}{\tau_{I}} \pm \sqrt{\left(\frac{M_{E E}-1}{\tau_{E}}-\frac{M_{I I}-1}{\tau_{I}}\right)^{2}+4 \frac{-1}{M_{E I} M_{I E}^{1}}} \tau_{E} \tau_{I}\right) ~$
Next page plots real and imaginary parts of $\lambda$ as a function of $\tau_{I}$

## Phase Plane and Eigenvalue Analysis



## Damped Oscillations in the Network

Choose $\tau_{I}=30 \mathrm{~ms}$ (makes real part of eigenvalues negative)


## Unstable Behavior and Limit Cycle

Choose $\tau_{I}=50 \mathrm{~ms}$ (makes real part of eigenvalues positive)

A



B


Oscillations grow initially but curbed by rectification nonlinearity

