CSE440: Introduction to HCI
Methods for Design, Prototyping and Evaluating User Interaction

Lecture 03:
Design Critique

Nigini Oliveira
Abhinav Yadav
Liang He
Angel Vuong
Jeremy Viny
What about Friday Section?
What do you want to improve?

Help travellers to connect with their families and we all to sleep better

Balance out the amount of time children and others spend on digital devices and gaming

Increase awareness of consuming footprint

Cook at home and eating healthier

Make commuting faster and driving safer

Help communities that need outdoor installations and social encounters

Manage time and health for students and content (sometimes harmful) for readers

Support people on taking care of their loyal companions: plants and pets
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Apr 9</th>
<th>Apr 10</th>
<th>Apr 11</th>
<th>Apr 12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Designing Critique</strong></td>
<td><strong>1b - Project Proposal</strong></td>
<td><strong>Design of Everyday Things</strong></td>
<td><strong>Section</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00 - 11:20</td>
<td>10:00 - 11:20</td>
<td>10:00 - 11:20</td>
<td>10:30 - 11:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nigini’s office hours</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>MGH 058</strong></td>
<td><strong>MGH 058</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00 - 12:00</td>
<td></td>
<td>11:30 - 12:20</td>
<td>1:30 - 2:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Allen Center 338</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>MGH 058</strong></td>
<td><strong>MGH 058</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2:30 - 3:20</td>
<td>2:30 - 3:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>1c - Revised Project Proposal</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Week Calendar*
Design Critique
Why critique?

Critique helps evaluate early, often, and cheaply
  Applicable to artifacts of many types
  Compare to other expert inspection methods

You are not your own worst (best!?) critic
  We collectively know more than any one of us
  It is hard to see past your own decisions
  Design requires getting past our own infatuation
Why critique?

You will encounter critique in many other disciplines
  visual art, writing, design, code (i.e., code review)

Over time, you should gather people who can give you high-quality critique in everything you do
  You may meet some of those people in this class!
Critique is about improvement
What is critique?

Critique is a method for feedback
It is not just a list of complaints

1. Presenters sit down with critics
2. Quickly explain their artifacts and their feedback needs
3. Critiques ask clarification questions, then give feedback
4. Presenters respond to questions and take notes on what is discussed
Critique is not criticism!

Seriously, not just a list of complaints

Critiques offer honest feedback
Both positive and negative
  Presenters should be able to learn what works well
  and what is problematic about their artifact

It is then presenter’s responsibility to sort through feedback, decide what is important, and how to act
  You must take notes for later review
Common issues in critique feedback

Lack of Clarity
Taking it Personal
Design Apathy
Contradictions
Indecisiveness
Resistance
Too much Negativity

(McDaniel)
Tips for those receiving feedback

Taking advice is not giving up authorship
  You still make the final decision
  A half-baked suggestion does not contain all the details of a finished solution

Design your critique
  What you show invites different forms of feedback
  Verbally indicate what kind of feedback you want, but also provide an artifact of appropriate form
  This course will guide you what feedback you invite at which stage
Tips for critics

Hamburger method:
- Bun: something fluffy and nice
- Meat: Criticism on how to improve
- Bun: Something fluffy and nice

I like, I wish, What if method:
- I like: Lead with something nice
- I wish: Some criticism, often leading from what you like
- What if: An idea to spark further conversation

Socratic method:
- Identify an aspect of design and ask “Why?”
- Can be good if unsure what else to say
- Forces presenter to give, or develop, explanations for decisions
- Avoids that the presenter gets defensive (gives him/her a chance to justify)
Tips for critics

Limit your use of personal pronouns (e.g., “you”)
Critique is about the artifact, not the designer!

A designer deserves honest feedback
Both positive and negative
Including clarity and rationale

Help with actionable suggestions
Critique summary

Fall out of love with the things you build
   Let others help you see past the infatuation

Get feedback early, often, and cheaply

Focus on improvement
   In brainstorming, we were not criticizing
   In critique, we are not defending

You will learn to both give and receive critique
   If you are having difficulties… (join the club)! =)
Project Proposals
Sit with people from your Section
(3-4 people per group!)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A (10:30)</th>
<th>B (11:30)</th>
<th>C (1:30)</th>
<th>D (2:30)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 people</td>
<td>4 people</td>
<td>4 people</td>
<td>4 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 people</td>
<td>4 people</td>
<td>4 people</td>
<td>4 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 people</td>
<td>4 people</td>
<td>3 people</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 PERSON</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(MOVE to A or C?)
Proposal draft activity (Step one)

5 minutes: Take turns to present your favorite idea as submitted in assignment 1a.

Only one idea per person.
Proposal draft activity (Step two)

5 minutes: After hearing all ideas, which ones are you most excited about? **Pick two ideas** that your team would like to move forward with.

If there is no consensus, discuss how the ideas could be combined.
Proposal draft activity (Step three)

10 minutes: For each of the two ideas, discuss the questions on the handout.

Pick the idea that is ultimately most promising.
Proposal draft activity (Step four)

3 minutes: **Prepare to present** and get feedback.

- Who will present? (The others should take notes)
- What will be presented in a 1-2 minutes pitch?
Peer-feedback session

5 (x2) minutes: Partner with another team and take turns in providing each other with feedback.

- Pitch your project idea (2 minutes)
- Get feedback from the other group (3 minutes)
- Invert and repeat
Feedback questions:

What do you think is interesting about the chosen **domain and target group**?

How do you think this target group could be interviewed or observed (within the **scope of this class**)?

Why do you think is the **design problem** unique and important?

Do you know whether the design problem has been **addressed in the past**, and if yes, how? (We want to avoid creating another Facebook or Meet-up!)

In general, do you think the project can be turned into something **exciting and novel**? Or is there a way to give it a more exciting twist?
Ask me something!