

Problem Set 4

Due: Wednesday, October 26, by 11:59pm

Instructions

Solutions format, collaboration policy, and late policy. See PSet 1 for further details. The same requirements and policies still apply. Also follow the typesetting instructions from the prior PSets.

Solutions submission. You must submit your solution via Gradescope. In particular:

- For the solutions to Task 1-6, and the written part of Task 7, submit under “PSet 4 [Written]” a *single* PDF file containing the solution to all tasks in the homework. Each numbered task should be solved on its own page (or pages). Follow the prompt on Gradescope to link tasks to your pages. Do not write your name on the individual pages – Gradescope will handle that.
- For the programming part (part of Task 7), submit your code under “PSet 4 [Coding]” as a file called `bloom.py`.
- For the extra credit Task (Task 8), submit a separate PDF file under “PSet 4 [Extra]”.

Task 1 – Fair Game

[10 pts]

Consider the following game, defined by a parameter k : Roll a fair, 6-sided die three times independently. If you roll a six

- no times, then you lose 1 dollar.
- exactly once, you win 1 dollar.
- exactly twice, then you win 2 dollars.
- all three times, then you win k dollars

For what value of k is this game fair? (The game is fair if your expected payoff is 0.)

Task 2 – Raining Cats and Dogs

[12 pts]

Suppose that $8n$ animals are partitioned into pairs at random, with each partition being equally likely. If the set consists of $5n$ dogs and $3n$ cats, what is the expected number of dog-cat pairs?

Task 3 – Triple fun

[15 pts]

This problems concerns two kinds of graphs. The *complete graph on n vertices* has a set V of vertices with $|V| = n$ and a set E of *edges*, one edge for each pair of elements of V . It is denoted by K_n . A *tournament on n vertices* is a directed graph that consists of a set V of vertices with $|V| = n$ and a set E of directed edges, one for each pair of vertices $u, v \in V$ that has exactly one of the two directed edges (u, v) or (v, u) .

- a) Suppose that we independently flip fair coins, one per edge of K_n , and color each edge *red* if its coin is heads and *blue* if the coin is tails. What is the expected number of *triangles* (triples of vertices) that have their edges colored the same (all blue or all red).

- b) Suppose that we independently flip fair coins, one per vertex of K_n , and color each vertex *red* if its coin is heads and *blue* if the coin is tails. What is the expected number of *triangles* (triples of vertices) that have all their vertices colored the same (all blue or all red).
- c) Suppose that we choose a tournament on n vertices with $V = \{1, 2, \dots, n\}$ randomly by independently flipping fair coins, one per pair of vertices $\{u, v\} \in V$ with $u < v$ and include the edge (u, v) , that is u points to v , if the coin is heads and include the edge (v, u) , v points to u , if the coin is tails. What is the expected number of directed cycles of length three in this randomly chosen tournament? (Recall that in a directed cycle one can follow the directed edges and end up where you started.)

Task 4 – Independence

[14 pts]

We are given two independent random variables, M and K , both taking integer values between 0 and 99. Further, assume that you know that the distribution of K is uniform; i.e., $\mathbb{P}(K = i) = 1/100$ for all $i \in \{0, 1, 2, \dots, 99\}$. You do not know anything else about the distribution of M . Finally, we define a new random variable C as

$$C = (M + K) \bmod 100 .$$

- a) For all fixed values $m, c \in \{0, 1, \dots, 99\}$, use what you know about modular arithmetic and the independence of random variables M and K to write the probability $\mathbb{P}(C = c, M = m)$ in terms of $\mathbb{P}(M = m)$.
- b) Use part a) and the Law of Total Probability to compute $\mathbb{P}(C = c)$ as a function of $c \in \{0, 1, \dots, 99\}$.
- c) Use the definition of independence together with your solutions to parts a) and b) to show that M and C are (mutually) independent.

Task 5 – Some Really Odd Dice!

[14 pts]

You are playing a game that uses a fair 8-sided die whose faces are numbered by the odd numbers, 1, 3, 5, ..., 15. The value of a roll is the number showing on the top of the die when it comes to rest. Give all answers as simplified fractions.

- a) Let X be the value of one roll of the die. Compute $\mathbb{E}[X]$ and $\text{Var}(X)$.
- b) Let Y be the sum of the values of 5 independent rolls of the die. Compute $\mathbb{E}[Y]$ and $\text{Var}(Y)$. Use independence, and state precisely where in your computation you are using it.
- c) Let Z be the **average** of the values of n independent rolls of the die. Compute $\mathbb{E}[Z]$ and $\text{Var}(Z)$. Use independence, and state precisely where in your computation you are using it.

Task 6 – Packet Failures

[18 pts]

Consider three different models for sending n packets over the Internet:

1. Each packet takes a different path. Each path fails independently with probability p ;
2. All packets take the exact same path which fails with probability p . Thus, either all the packets get through or none get through;
3. Half the packets take one path, and half take the other (assume n is even), and each of the two paths fails independently with probability p .

Let X_i be the number of packets lost in case i , for $i = 1, 2, 3$. Write down the probability mass function, the expectation of X_i and the variance of X_i for $i = 1, 2, 3$.

Task 7 – Bloom filters [Coding+Written]

[10+7 pts]

Google Chrome has a huge database of malicious URLs, but it takes a long time to do a database lookup (think of this as a typical [Set](#)). They want to have a quick check in the web browser itself, so a space-efficient data structure must be used. A **Bloom filter** is a **probabilistic data structure** which only supports the following two operations:

- **add(x)**: Add an element x to the structure.
- **contains(x)**: Check if an element x is in the structure. If either returns “definitely not in the set” or “could be in the set”.

It does **not** support the following two operations:

- delete an element from the structure.
- return an element that is in the structure.

The idea is that we can check our Bloom filter to see if a URL is in the set. The Bloom filter is always correct in saying a URL definitely isn't in the set, but may have false positives – it may say that a URL is in the set when it isn't. Only in these rare cases does Chrome have to perform an expensive database lookup to know for sure. Suppose that we have k **bit arrays** t_1, \dots, t_k each of length m (all entries are 0 or 1), so the total space required is only km bits or $km/8$ bytes (as a byte is 8 bits). Suppose that the universe of URL's is the set \mathcal{U} (think of this as all strings with less than 100 characters), and we have k **independent and uniform** hash functions $h_1, \dots, h_k : \mathcal{U} \rightarrow \{0, 1, \dots, m-1\}$. That is, for an element x and hash function h_i , pretend $h_i(x)$ is a **discrete** $\text{Unif}[0, m-1]$ random variable. Suppose that we implement the **add** and **contains** function as follows:

Algorithm 1 Bloom Filter Operations

```
1: function INITIALIZE(k,m)
2:   for  $i = 1, \dots, k$ : do
3:      $t_i =$  new bit array of  $m$  0's
4: function ADD(x)
5:   for  $i = 1, \dots, k$ : do
6:      $t_i[h_i(x)] = 1$ 
7: function CONTAINS(x)
   return  $t_1[h_1(x)] == 1 \wedge t_2[h_2(x)] == 1 \wedge \dots \wedge t_k[h_k(x)] == 1$ 
```

Refer to the slides from Lecture 10 and Section 9.4 of the textbook for more details on Bloom filters.

a) Implement the functions **add** and **contains** in the **BloomFilter** class of **bloom.py**.

To solve this task, we have set up a corresponding edstem lesson [here](#). Press the Mark button above the terminal to run the unit tests we have written for you. Passing these unit tests is not enough. We have written a number of different tests for the Gradescope autograder. Your score on Gradescope will be your actual score - you have unlimited attempts to submit.

b) Let's compare this approach to using a typical [Set](#) data structure. Google wants to store 1 million URLs, with each URL taking (on average) 23 bytes.

- How much space (in MB, 1 MB = 1 million bytes) is required if we store all the elements in a set?
- How much space (in MB) is required if we store all the elements in a Bloom filter with $k = 10$ hash functions and $m = 800,000$ buckets? Recall that 1 byte = 8 bits.

- c) Let's analyze the time improvement as well. Let's say an average Chrome user attempts to visit 36,500 URLs in a year, only 1,000 of which are actually malicious. Suppose it takes half a second for Chrome to make a call to the database (the [Set](#)), and only 1 millisecond for Chrome to check containment in the Bloom filter. Suppose the false positive rate on the Bloom filter is 4%; that is, if a website is not malicious, the Bloom filter will incorrectly report it as malicious with probability 0.04. What is the time (in seconds) taken if we only use the database, and what is the *expected* time taken (in seconds) to check all 36,500 strings if we used the Bloom filter + database combination described earlier?

Task 8 – Extra Credit Problem

You are shown two envelopes and told the following facts:

- Each envelope has some number of dollars in it, but you don't know how many.
- The amount in the first envelope is different from the amount in the second.
- Although you don't know exactly how much money is in each envelope, you are told that it is an integer number of dollars that is at least 1 and at most 100.
- You are told that you can pick an envelope, look inside, and then you will be given a one-time option to switch envelopes (without looking inside the new envelope). You will then be allowed to keep the money in envelope you end up with.

Your strategy is the following:

1. You pick an envelope uniformly at random.
2. You open it and count the amount of money inside. Say the result is x .
3. You then select an integer y between 1 and 100 uniformly at random.
4. If $y > x$, you switch envelopes, otherwise you stay with the envelope you picked in step (a)

Show that you have a better than 50-50 chance of taking home the envelope with the larger amount of money in it. More specifically, suppose the two envelopes have i and j dollars in them respectively, where $i < j$. Calculate the probability that you take home the envelope with the larger amount of money.