Lecture 8: Predicate Logic Proofs, English Proofs



MY MATH TEACHER WAS A BIG BELIEVER IN PROOF BY INTIMIDATION.

Last class: Inference Rules for Quantifiers



A Not so Odd Example

Domain of Discourse Integers

Predicate Definitions
Even(x) :=
$$\exists y (x = 2 \cdot y)$$

Odd(x) := $\exists y (x = 2 \cdot y + 1)$

Prove "There is an even number"

Formally: prove $\exists x Even(x)$

A Not so Odd Example

Domain of Discourse Integers Predicate DefinitionsEven(x) := $\exists y (x = 2 \cdot y)$ Odd(x) := $\exists y (x = 2 \cdot y + 1)$

Prove "There is an even number"

Formally: prove $\exists x Even(x)$

1.	2 = 2 · 1	Algebra
2.	∃y (2 = 2 ·y)	Intro ∃: 1
3.	Even(2)	Definition of Even: 2
4.	∃x Even(x)	Intro ∃: 3

A Prime Example

Domain of Discourse Integers

Predicate Definitions

Even(x) := ∃y (x = 2·y) Odd(x) := ∃y (x = 2·y + 1) Prime(x) := "x > 1 and x≠a·b for all integers a, b with 1<a<x"

Prove "There is an even prime number" Formally: prove $\exists x (Eve_n(x) \land Prime(x))$

Even (2) 1 Shm (2) Fx (Even (K) 1 Jone (K)) Info F:

A Prime Example

Domain of Discourse

Integers

Predicate Definitions Even(x) := $\exists y (x = 2 \cdot y)$ Odd(x) := $\exists y (x = 2 \cdot y + 1)$ Prime(x) := "x > 1 and x≠a \cdot b for all integers a, b with 1<a<x"

Prove "There is an even prime number"

Formally: prove $\exists x (Even(x) \land Prime(x))$

1.	$2 = 2 \cdot 1$	Algebra
2.	∃y (2 = 2 ·y)	Intro ∃: 1
3.	Even(2)	Def of Even: 3
4.	Prime(2)*	Property of integers
5.	Even(2) ^ Prime(2)	Intro ∧: 2, 4
6.	$\exists x (Even(x) \land Prime(x))$	Intro ∃: 5

* Later we will further break down "Prime" using quantifiers to prove statements like this

Inference Rules for Quantifiers: First look







1. Let a be an arbitrary integer



3. $\forall x (Even(x) \rightarrow Even(x^2))$

?
Intro ∀: 1,2









Even and Odd

Even(x) := $\exists y (x=2y)$ $Odd(x) := \exists y (x=2y+1)$ **Domain: Integers**



Prove: "The square of any even number is even." Formal proof of: $\forall x (Even(x) \rightarrow Even(x^2))$

1. Let a be an arbitrary integer

- **2.1** Even(a)
- **2.2** $\exists y (a = 2y)$
- 2.3 a = 2b
- **2.4** $a^2 = 4b^2 = 2(2b^2)$ Algebra
- **2.5** $\exists y (a^2 = 2y)$
- **2.6** Even(**a**²)

2. Even(a) \rightarrow Even(a²)

3. $\forall x (Even(x) \rightarrow Even(x^2))$ Intro $\forall : 1, 2$

Definition of Even Elim 🗄: 🖕 Used $a^2 = 2c$ for $c=2b^2$ Intro **∃** Definition of Even Direct Proof

Assumption

These rules need some caveats...

There are extra conditions on using these rules:



Without those rules, it is possible to infer claims that are false

Without the rules, one could infer false claims...

There are extra conditions on using these rules:



Over integer domain: $\forall x \exists y (y \neq x)$ is True but $\exists y \forall x (y \neq x)$ is False

BAD "PROOF"1. $\forall x \exists y (y \neq x)$ Given2. Let a be an arbitrary integer3. $\exists y (y \neq a)$ Elim $\forall: 1$ 4. $b \neq a$ Elim $\exists: 3$ (b new constant)5. $\forall x (b \neq x)$ Intro $\forall: 2,4$ 6. $\exists y \forall x (y \neq x)$ Intro $\exists: 5$

With the extra conditions we can kill the bad proof...





Can't get rid of a since another name in the same line, b, depends on it!

Inference Rules for Quantifiers: Full version



- In principle, formal proofs are the standard for what it means to be "proven" in mathematics
 – almost all math (and theory CS) done in Predicate Logic
- But they are tedious and impractical
 - e.g., applications of commutativity and associativity
 - Russell & Whitehead's formal proof that 1+1 = 2 appears after more than 100 pages of build up
 - we allowed ourselves to cite "Arithmetic", "Algebra", etc.
- Similar situation exists in programming...

Programming

Assembly Language

High-level Language

Programming vs Proofs

a := ADD(i, 1)
b := MOD(a, n)
c := ADD(arr, b)
d := LOAD(c)
e := ADD(arr, i)
STORE(e, d)

Given Given Elim ∧: 1 Double Negation: 4 Elim ∨: 3, 5 Modus Ponens: 2, 6

Assembly Language for Programs

Assembly Language for Proofs

Proofs

Given Given ∧ Elim: 1 Double Negation: 4 ∨ Elim: 3, 5 MP: 2, 6

what is the "Java" for proofs?

Assembly Language for Proofs

High-level Language for Proofs

Proofs

Given Given ∧ Elim: 1 Double Negation: 4 ∨ Elim: 3, 5 MP: 2, 6

Assembly Language for Proofs

High-level Language for Proofs

Proofs

Given Given ∧ Elim: 1 Double Negation: 4 ∨ Elim: 3, 5 MP: 2, 6

Assembly Language for Proofs

High-level Language for Proofs

- Formal proofs follow simple well-defined rules and should be easy for a machine to check
 - as assembly language is easy for a machine to execute
- English proofs correspond to those rules but are designed to be easier for humans to read
 - also easy to check with practice

(almost all actual math and theory CS is done this way)

 English proof is correct if the <u>reader</u> is convinced that they could translate it into a formal proof (the reader is the "compiler" for English proofs)

Even(x) $\equiv \exists y (x=2y)$ $Odd(x) \equiv \exists y (x=2y+1)$ **Domain: Integers**

Prove: "The square of every even number is even." Formal proof of: $\forall x (Even(x) \rightarrow Even(x^2))$

1. Let a be an arbitrary integer

- **2.1** Even(a)
- 2.3 a = 2b
- **2.4** $a^2 = 4b^2 = 2(2b^2)$ Algebra
- **2.5** $\exists y (a^2 = 2y)$
- **2.** Even(a) \rightarrow Even(a²) Direct Proof
- **3.** $\forall x (Even(x) \rightarrow Even(x^2))$ Intro \forall

- Assumption
- **2.2** $\exists y (a = 2y)$ Definition of Even
 - Elim 🗄
 - Intro 🗄
- **2.6** Even(a²) Definition of Even

Prove "The square of every even integer is even."



Prove "The square of every even integer is even."

Proof: Let **a** be an arbitrary integer.

Suppose **a** is even. Then, by definition, $\mathbf{a} = 2\mathbf{b}$ for some integer **b**. Squaring both sides, we get $\mathbf{a}^2 = 4\mathbf{b}^2 = 2(2\mathbf{b}^2)$. So \mathbf{a}^2 is, by definition, is even.

Since **a** was arbitrary, we have shown that the square of every even number is even. ■

Prove "The square of every even integer is even."

Proof: Let **a** be an arbitrary **even** integer.

Then, by definition, $\mathbf{a} = 2\mathbf{b}$ for some integer **b**. Squaring both sides, we get $\mathbf{a}^2 = 4\mathbf{b}^2 = 2(2\mathbf{b}^2)$. So \mathbf{a}^2 is, by definition, is even.

Since **a** was arbitrary, we have shown that the square of every even number is even. ■

 $\forall x (Even(x) \rightarrow Even(x^2))$

Predicate Definitions Even(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y)$ Odd(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y + 1)$

Prove "The sum of two odd numbers is even." Formally, prove $\forall x \forall y ((Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y))$

Hx Hy (10 dd(x1 1 Odd(y1) -> Eren(x+y))

Predicate Definitions Even(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y)$ Odd(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y + 1)$

Prove "The sum of two odd numbers is even." Formally, prove $\forall x \forall y ((Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y))$

Let x and y be arbitrary integers.

Let x be an arbitrary integer
 Let y be an arbitrary integer
 2. Let y be an arbitrary integer

Since x and y were arbitrary, the sum of any odd integers is even.

3,10 Even(Kty)

- **3.** $(Odd(\mathbf{x}) \land Odd(\mathbf{y})) \rightarrow Even(\mathbf{x}+\mathbf{y})$
- **4.** $\forall \mathbf{y} ((\text{Odd}(\mathbf{x}) \land \text{Odd}(\mathbf{y})) \rightarrow \text{Even}(\mathbf{x}+\mathbf{y}))$ Intro \forall
- **5.** $\forall x \forall y ((Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y))$ Intro \forall

Predicate Definitions Even(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y)$

 $Odd(x) \equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y + 1)$

Domain of Discourse Integers

Prove "The sum of two odd numbers is even." Formally, prove $\forall x \forall y ((Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y))$

Let x and y be arbitrary integers.

Suppose that both are odd.

Even and Odd <

so x+y is even.

Since x and y were arbitrary, the sum of any odd integers is even.

1. Let x be an arbitrary integer 2. Let y be an arbitrary integer 3.1 Odd(x) \land Odd(y) Assumption 3.2 Odd(x) 3.9 \bigcirc Odd(x) 3.9 \bigcirc Odd(x) 3.9 \bigcirc Odd(y) \bigcirc Odd(y) 3.9 \bigcirc Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y) DPR 4. \forall y ((Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y)) Intro \forall 5. \forall x \forall y ((Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y)) Intro \forall Predicate Definitions Even(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y)$ Odd(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y + 1)$

Prove "The sum of two odd numbers is even." Formally, prove $\forall x \forall y ((Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y))$

Let x and y be arbitrary integers.

Suppose that both are odd.

so x+y is even.

Since x and y were arbitrary, the sum of any odd integers is even.

- Let x be an arbitrary integer
 Let y be an arbitrary integer
 - 3.1 Odd(x) \land Odd(y) Assumption 3.2 Odd(x) Elim \land : 2.1 3.3 Odd(y) Elim \land : 2.1 3.4 $\exists z (x=2=2+1)$ Def \land odd $\exists z = x=1 \cdot a + 1 \quad \text{Eku } \exists : a \text{ deput}$ 3.9 Even(x+y) 3. (Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y) DPR 4. $\forall y ((\text{Odd}(x) \land \text{Odd}(y)) \rightarrow$ Even(x+y)) Intro \forall
 - **5.** $\forall \mathbf{x} \forall \mathbf{y} ((\text{Odd}(\mathbf{x}) \land \text{Odd}(\mathbf{y})) \rightarrow \text{Even}(\mathbf{x}+\mathbf{y}))$ Intro \forall

Prove "The sum of two odd numbers is even."

Let x and y be arbitrary integers.	nteger nteger	
Suppose that both are odd.	 3.1 Odd(x) ∧ Odd(y) 3.2 Odd(x) 3.3 Odd(y) 	Assumption Elim ∧: 2.1 Elim ∧: 2.1
Then, we have x = 2a+1 for some integer a and y = 2b+1 for	3.4 $\exists z (x = 2z+1)$ 3.5 $x = 2a+1$	Def of Odd: 2.2 Elim ∃: 2.4
some integer b.	3.6 $\exists z (y = 2z+1)$ 3.7 $y = 2b+1$	Def of Odd: 2.3 Elim \exists : 2.5
	xty = Latist	(451) = 2(a+b+11
so x+y is, by definition, even.	3.9 ∃z (x+y = 2z) 3.10 Even(x+y)	Intro ∃: 2.4 Def of Even
Since x and y were arbitrary, the sum of any odd integers is even.	3. $(Odd(\mathbf{x}) \land Odd(\mathbf{y})) \rightarrow E$ 4. $\forall \mathbf{y} ((Odd(\mathbf{x}) \land Odd(\mathbf{y})))$ 5. $\forall \mathbf{x} \forall \mathbf{y} ((Odd(\mathbf{x}) \land Odd(\mathbf{y})))$	\rightarrow Even(x + y)) Intro \forall

Prove "The sum of two odd numbers is even."

Let x and y be arbitrary integers.	 Let x be an arbitrary integer Let y be an arbitrary integer 		
Suppose that both are odd.	 3.1 Odd(x) ∧ Odd(y) 3.2 Odd(x) 3.3 Odd(y) 	Assumption Elim ∧: 2.1 Elim ∧: 2.1	
Then, we have x = 2a+1 for some integer a and y = 2b+1 for	3.4 ∃z (x = 2z+1) 3.5 x = 2a+1	Def of Odd: 2.2 Elim ∃: 2.4	
some integer b.	3.6 ∃z (y = 2z+1) 3.7 y = 2b+1	Def of Odd: 2.3 Elim ∃: 2.5	
Their sum is x+y = = 2(a+b+1)	3.8 x+y = 2(a+b+1)	Algebra	
so x+y is, by definition, even.	3.9 ∃z (x+y = 2z) 3.10 Even(x+y)	Intro∃: 2.4 Def of Even	
Since x and y were arbitrary, the sum of any odd integers is even.	3. $(Odd(\mathbf{x}) \land Odd(\mathbf{y})) \rightarrow Even up to the second sec$	\rightarrow Even(x + y)) Intro \forall	

5. $\forall x \forall y ((Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y))$ Intro \forall

Predicate Definitions Even(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y)$ Odd(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y + 1)$

Prove "The sum of two odd numbers is even."

Proof: Let x and y be arbitrary integers.

Suppose that both are odd. Then, we have x = 2a+1 for some integer a and y = 2b+1 for some integer b. Their sum is x+y = (2a+1) + (2b+1) = 2a+2b+2 = 2(a+b+1), so x+y is, by definition, even.

Since x and y were arbitrary, the sum of any two odd integers is even. ■

Predicate Definitions Even(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y)$ Odd(x) $\equiv \exists y \ (x = 2y + 1)$

Prove "The sum of two odd numbers is even."

Proof: Let x and y be arbitrary **odd** integers.

Then, x = 2a+1 for some integer a and y = 2b+1 for some integer b. Their sum is x+y = (2a+1) + (2b+1) = 2a+2b+2 = 2(a+b+1), so x+y is, by definition, even.

Since x and y were arbitrary, the sum of any two odd integers is even.



 $\forall x \forall y ((Odd(x) \land Odd(y)) \rightarrow Even(x+y))$